

# Tenure erosion can be a subversive tool

If the law protects the tenure, the office-bearer is ring-fenced from acting under fear of being sacked



**WITHOUT CONTEMPT**

SOMASEKHAR SUNDARESAN

Tenure protection for public servants is under attack. Amendments to the Right to Information Act, 2005, passed in this session of Parliament have blown off two fundamental statutory protections enjoyed by information commissioners all over the country — first, a statutory protection of tenure for information

commissioners, and second, protection of their remuneration. Both, tenure and remuneration for information commissioners at the central level and the state level, will henceforth be “as may be prescribed” by the Central government. Before the amendment, there was a tenure of at least five years unless the incumbent reached the age of 65. Likewise, remuneration of the commissioners was on par with those available to the members of the Election Commission (and in the states with the chief secretary of the state) — which also underlined the importance of this office. Now that the Central government will decide both the tenure and the terms of remuneration of information commissioners at the Centre and at the states, the Central government will get to wield full political leverage over information commissioners all over the country. How the incumbents deal with enforcing the citizen's right to information will

be determined by how the reins are wielded by the government in power. Tenure protection lies at the heart of protecting public office. If the law protects the tenure, the office-bearer is ring-fenced from acting under fear of being sacked. Our Constitution protects the tenure of the higher judiciary (the only way to remove a judge is through impeachment) only to ensure independence of the judge. It is because tenure of the judge is protected, that the manner of selection becomes the core issue with judicial appointments. When the Supreme Court found that the trial of those accused of demolishing the Babri Masjid had dragged on for a quarter of a century, in 2017, it set a deadline of two years for completion of the trial with the judge being protected against any transfer. Last month, when it found that the judge would retire in two months, the court directed that the

judge's tenure be extended to let him focus on and complete the trial in nine months. At the heart of the issue was protecting the tenure for the junior judge to ensure that a very important trial was indeed completed. Prakash Singh, a retired police officer, pursued public interest litigation, which led to the Supreme Court stipulating a two-year tenure protection for every police officer, right from the Director General of Police of a State to the Station House Officer heading a police station. Repeated attempts by state governments to have this disturbed, have so far been broadly repelled by the Supreme Court. Diabolically, some states were found rewarding loyal police officers with appointment to the post of Director General on the eve of their retirement so that they could enjoy another two years of legally-protected service tenure. Governments and their incumbents (both political and bureaucratic) have the deepest vested interests in resisting tenure reform.

Officers of regulatory agencies too are meant to have tenure protection. The law governing the office of the governor of the Reserve Bank of India, historically the most fiercely independent regulator, does not have age stipulations. That is why the term for which the governor is appointed by the government is a strong tool for exercise of governmental influence, if not control, over this sensitive office. An obnoxious practice of regulatory appointments for a specific term, extendable by another term at the discretion of the government, has also developed. This practice enables keeping the incumbent on leash — a “safe pair of hands”, particularly towards the end of tenure.

Central bankers are wont to say having a little inflation is like being a little pregnant. This adage is equally true with legislation. Once a subversive measure is introduced in an area of law, it will inexorably find its way into other areas. The erosion of tenure protection for information commissioners could well be a cancerous cell that may turn into a malignant subversion for any other statutory or regulatory institution.

The author is an advocate and independent counsel. Tweets @SomasekharS

## CHINESE WHISPERS

Tandon must wait



The Bharatiya Janata Party's Lajji Tandon (pictured) took oath as the new governor of Madhya Pradesh earlier this week. But he will have to wait a while before shifting to his official residence and is staying in the President Suite of the Raj Bhawan. He has to wait because the former governor of the state, Anandiben Patel, who is now governor of Uttar Pradesh, is yet to move out. Also, the whole compound is being renovated in accordance with Tandon's specifications. Once the renovation work is completed, Tandon hopes to move in after performing a puja and some rituals to ward off the evil eye.

Case in point

Only one of the two MPs of a political party that rules a southern state voted against the 'triple talaq' Bill in the Rajya Sabha on Tuesday. Sources said the party's other MP absented himself when the vote took place to signal that it was the party's political compulsion to oppose the Bill. When Opposition leaders demanded the party MPs explain their conduct, they had a one-word answer: “Nineteen”. As an Opposition MP struggled to understand its significance, the MPs explained “19” was the number of cases their party chief faced.

No time for press freedom

On July 4, members of 15 political parties requested a “short-duration discussion” in the Rajya Sabha on “how to strengthen the freedom of the press, as the media

is the fourth pillar of democracy”. A majority of those who requested the discussion are members of Opposition parties, but Bharatiya Janata Party Rajya Sabha MP Subramanian Swamy (pictured) also signed the notice. The government, however, suggested a short-duration discussion on “the need to ensure basic facilities and affordable treatment to cancer patients”. The Rajya Sabha took up the discussion on the issue of cancer on Wednesday and another “half-an-hour” discussion on the “clean Ganga drive”. The Opposition was told that the Rajya Sabha would not have the time during the current session, which ends on August 7, to have a discussion on the “freedom of the press”.

# Powering the EV mandate

Public and private sector enterprises have started investing in the eco-system for electric vehicles but viability remains an issue

T E NARASIMHAN

Last week, the GST council cut rate cuts on electric vehicles (EVs) from 12 per cent to 5 per cent and on electric chargers from 18 to 5 per cent, a clear signal that it proposes to forge ahead with its target of reducing urban pollution and crude oil import bill. Both rate cuts will considerably narrow the price differential between EVs and petrol and diesel vehicles. EV prices are expected to drop 7 per cent.

But narrowing the price differential is just one of the challenges to achieving the government's grand mandate. The lack of a robust ecosystem, principally recharging stations, and domestic battery manufacturing capabilities, could well short-circuit the government's stiff electric mobility targets. Most two-wheeler makers — Bajaj Auto, TVS, Hero and others — have been vocal on this point. Steffen Knapp, director, Volkswagen Passenger Cars, recently said his company doesn't think it possible to be part of India's electrification plan in the absence of supporting infrastructure.

Things could be changing now, with several public sector enterprises, private sector engineering and automobile companies as well as new-age start-ups venturing into the EV infrastructure



business (see table). “Having such full-scale infrastructure would definitely push the buying decision in favour of EVs,” said Maxson Lewis, managing director, Magenta Power, an EV mobility solutions provider. What kind of infrastructure is needed to achieve the government's mandate that all three-wheelers and two-wheelers go electric by 2023 and 2025 respectively, and others except commercial vehicles, by the year 2030. One estimate by Nomura Research puts the investment requirement of charging stations at ₹13,000-14,000 crore. Private sector start-ups alone are expected to add 50,000 to 60,000 charging stations over the next three years. Their contention is that given the initial low viability of the business, some sort of viability gap funding would be in order. In the second edition of its electric mobility policy (known as FAME 2), the government says it will allocate Rs 10,000 crore to set up charging stations to both public and private sector players.

“As a standalone business, EV charging stations is still a sunrise venture. It could be the future version of what gas stations are today, a money spinner, but only if investors are willing to wait,” says a Tata Power executive.

Others suggest pushing for low-grade charging at home, offices and

other locations where vehicles stop – globally, these touch points account for 80 per cent of EV charging points. So far the only progress here has been a suggestion from the power ministry to state power utilities to facilitate such private charging points.

The availability of lithium-ion batteries will also be a critical determinant of EV adoption by consumers. Batteries account for over half an EV's cost and, currently, are almost entirely imported from China. India would require six plants of 10GWh each by 2025 and 12 by 2030 to cater to this emerging market.

Niti Aayog CEO Amitabh Kant said the objective was to “first work on about 80 per cent of components of two and three-wheelers and buses and also push manufacturing of batteries in India”. To this end, the government is likely to issue tenders to set up 50 GWh of battery manufacturing in India, which would attract around \$50 billion in investment. “At present India depends on China for EV parts. However, by 2022, local production of cells will go up and even fuel cell might come to India,” says a Tata Motors Ltd spokesperson.

One of the Tata group companies, Tata Chemicals, has already announced that it will set up a 10 GWh plant at Dholera, Gujarat. Several companies — established ones and new-age start-ups — are venturing into this business (see table).

Setting up local plants is only part



Companies setting up EV charging stations

PUBLIC SECTOR:

BSES Rajdhani Power, IOC, Hindustan Petroleum, BHEL, Energy Efficiency Services (EESL), Union housing ministry

PRIVATE SECTOR:

Tata Power, Ather Energy, Vakkrangee, Magenta Power, ABB, Acme Industries, Fortum India,

Companies getting into battery manufacturing

ESTABLISHED PLAYERS:

Suzuki Motor Corporation, BHEL, Adani, Group, Amara Raja, Exide Industries, Greaves Cotton, Tata Chemicals

NEW AGE COMPANIES:

Exicom, Greenfuel Energy Solutions, Trontek, Coslight India, Napino Auto & Electronics, Trinity Energy Systems and Versatile Auto Components.

of the challenge. As Amara Raja Batteries CEO S Vijayanand points out, only a high level of localisation will make the business viable. Currently, the raw material for batteries are not available in India. Battery chemicals account for 30-40 per cent of the costs of a battery pack, and the cell accounts for 25-30 per cent. Even a cell-to-battery assembly plant would improve value addition by 30-40 per cent. But India has such annual assembly capacity worth just 1 Gwh.

Companies like Amara Raja have, however, started back-end integration to accelerate the pace of localisation. The company established a battery

pack assembly capability and looking at backward integration into cell manufacturing. Right now, its localisation level is 25-30 per cent at the battery pack level.

Exercises such as these are, however, time consuming and unlikely to match demand. Yet they are vital to the success of the government's EV plans. As Vijayanand puts it, “India missed the magic of manufacturing consumer electronics and we also missed the magic of manufacturing in the renewable sector, such as the solar panels, but I think if you were to look at EVs, then as a country we cannot afford to miss the magic of manufacturing.”

## INSIGHT

# Tigers and growth



DHIRAJ NAYYAR

It is lazy and wrong to view the goals of economic growth and conservation of the environment as inherently contradictory. It may even be convenient for some interests. The reality is different. Just look at how India has succeeded in doubling the population of its tigers in the last decade, a period in which the economy has also registered high growth rates. In fact, the population of tigers declined drastically over the long decades when economic growth was not so high. Now, every stakeholder, whether the government, judiciary, industry, NGOs and citizens must accept, in principle, that India can grow rapidly while preserving the environment — forests and fauna, air and water.

Often, it is unhelpful to put environment before economic growth. Poverty, or the lack of prosperity, leads to much greater environmental degradation. If the majority is living a subsistence livelihood, if industries are primitive (in a technological sense) and if government is starved of resources — all the characteristics of under development — the consequences for the environment are severe and the possibilities of mitigation or upgradation near zero.

Prosperity is good for the environment. For a start, it endows the government with greater financial resources to address the challenge of environmental degradation. It also

enables the population to be more educated and aware — without citizen participation, government efforts to preserve the environment will amount to nothing. It makes industry more advanced, profitable and able to use the best in class technologies to minimise adverse impact in terms of air and water pollution and dislocation of flora and fauna.

The most significant gain from rapid economic progress is on the technology front. That helps directly in conservation of the environment. Among other things, tigers have been protected and nurtured through the latest tracking technology. Those who attempt to illegally kill them, that is, poachers, or those who destroy their natural habitats, for instance, illegal logging/deforestation, can be caught and deterred through the deployment of appropriate technology. In industries like mining, for example, which have traditionally been viewed as damaging to nature, technology has advanced to enable successful transplantation of flora and fauna to alternative locations. It is not unusual for mining companies to have bio-diversity officers in-house or to partner with international organisations working in the field of the environment to achieve this. Importantly, once the mining work has been completed and the area vacated by man and machine, the entire ecosystem can return to its original state. There is evidence of this in India (in Goa) and abroad (in South Africa) where industry is mandated to spend the resources to make sure that the regeneration happens at a very fast pace.

But what of damage already done? The good news is that nature regenerates itself. Damage can be reversed. Often, the absence of human beings helps as the curious case of the Chernobyl disaster zone in Ukraine has proved. Three decades after a catastrophic nuclear accident rendered a large zone unfit for human habitation — radiation is still danger-



India has succeeded in doubling the population of its tigers in the last decade, a period in which the economy has also registered high growth Photo: PTI

ously high — both flora and fauna have reappeared to reclaim the area. With planning and management, the regeneration can be achieved without large-scale human displacement necessitated by disaster.

It is already happening. The positive news on the tiger population is not the only reason to be optimistic in India. According to the Union Minister for Environment and Forests, India's forest cover has grown by 16,000 square kilometers in the last five years. India's experience in successfully expanding its forest cover is not unique. Europe has achieved impressive rates of reforestation adding an estimated 90,000 square kilometres (approximately the size of Portugal) in the 25 years since 1990. Perhaps, it is easier for advanced economies for the obvious reason that they are rich and have greater resources and fewer polluting industries — those have been outsourced to the emerging economies. But the point is that deliberate intervention can aid regeneration.

Needless to say, it is important to

not get carried away and give economic growth unfettered priority over nature because the quality of that growth will be poor and it will be unsustainable. Worse, it will adversely affect the livelihoods and health of all citizens which would negate the hard-won prosperity.

The admittedly tough challenge for the government and courts is to strike the right balance. Stalling economic activity, by invoking the environment is likely to be counter-productive unless, of course, there are very pressing reasons to do so. At the very least, the possibilities of mitigation with the use of technology and ample financial commitment must be heard before a final decision is made. Industry must become responsible. And civil society must not be irresponsible.

India, which is already charting a unique economic trajectory, has an opportunity to show the world that it is possible to become richer and greener at the same time. A 21st century tiger economy.

The author is Chief Economist, Vedanta

## LETTERS

Exercise caution

Even without verifying the facts, some leading Bengaluru business tycoons have jumped in to crucify the Income Tax authorities for Cafe Coffee Day (CCD) chain founder VG Siddhartha's unfortunate decision to end his life. In a letter purportedly signed by him, while taking the entire blame on himself for the “mistakes”, he has accused the former DG, Income Tax, for harassing him by attaching his shares that caused serious liquidity crunch. On the other hand, the IT authorities have clarified that the searches were based on solid evidence of tax evasion and that the attachments were ordered to safeguard interest of revenue, which in any case was later revoked on Siddhartha's request. According to them, even though Siddhartha had admitted to huge unaccounted for income, he did not include the entire admitted concealed income in his IT return. The action of IT authorities ordering provisional attachments of Siddhartha's assets are in accordance with the law, which may possibly cause financial hardship, but cannot be called “harassment”. At the same time, tax authorities must also exercise such powers judiciously so as not to bring a business entity's legitimate business to a grinding halt leading to a chain of adverse economic consequences.

S K Choudhury Bengaluru

The real tragedy

Apreros “CCD founder missing, massive search on (July 31)”, before one could finish reading the news about missing V G Siddhartha, owner of coffee shop chain Cafe Coffee Day, the news that his body

had been found on the shores of Netravati river has come as a big shock. The investigation agencies should look his death from all angles including the recent Karnataka horse trading exercise wherein some half a dozen rebels were kept in a hotel, all expenses paid by some unknown entity far away from the scene. After all, the deceased happens to be the son-in-law of a former chief minister of Karnataka who switched over to the Bharatiya Janata Party in 2017.

N Nagarajan Secunderabad

Do something useful

While I welcome Prime Minister Narendra Modi's participation in Discovery's wildlife show, I however, feel that the last person he should have associated with is Bear Grylls. Anyone who has watched even a few of this adventurer's *Man vs Wild* episodes knows the kind of wanton destruction of wildlife he perpetrates, in order to obtain food for his survival in the course of the futile “explorations” he undertakes on a variety of inhospitable terrains. One just doesn't understand what Gryll proposes to achieve or teach through them. He must realise that discretion is the better part of valour and imagine the number of innocent animals that can be spared if he can carry non-perishable food items with him in his backpack.

CV Krishna Manoj Telangana

Letters can be mailed, faxed or e-mailed to: The Editor, Business Standard Nehru House, 4 Bahadur Shah Zafar Marg New Delhi 110 002 Fax: (011) 23720201 E-mail: letters@bsmail.in All letters must have a postal address and telephone number



© Graphic Syndication, England

