

Springboks' Catch 22: Kolisi or not

The rugby case for the inspirational but fading South Africa skipper is powerful, but less so from a historical and political perspective

EXPRESS NEW SERVICE
OCTOBER 31

STUART BARNES of *The Times* who has written extensively on Springboks rugby has struck a chord of disruption with his suggestion that rugby logic dictates that Rassie doesn't include inspirational captain Siya Kolisi in his Starting XV. We look at the merits of the argument in the backdrop of Kolisi's rise to leadership and what it means to South Africa. (For the record, Kolisi has been used in an extended 40-min first-half mostly, and subbed or called on in latter half, throughout the World Cup.)

BARNES' BURNING ISSUE

"South Africa have more chance of winning without their captain," Barnes writes, adding that Erasmus, if he can ignore the "historical and political perspective", should select his captain on the bench.

"The No 6 shirt should be worn by the South African who knows the game of Sam Underhill, England's key man, better than anyone — his fellow Bath flanker Francois Louw," he says, urging for a colour-blind decision. "The best chance of uniting 57 million South Africans is to play Louw from the kick-off. One man's inspiration will not suffice if South Africa

are incapable of nullifying England at the breakdown. Kolisi has not appeared to be the force that he was before a knee injury that he suffered in Super Rugby in May." The rugby case for benching Kolisi is powerful, Barnes insists. "Pieter-Steph du Toit has been far more influential in his lineup and counter-rucking than his fellow flanker. He has to start. But even Du Toit cannot compete quite like Louw at the breakdown."

He cites Louw's 74th-minute turnover in the semi-final win over Wales — a few minutes after coming on — as the match-winning moment to put South Africa in the final. "From the penalty, South Africa ended up with a kick to win the game. Would Kolisi have made that turnover? On the evidence of what came before, probably not," he argues. Barnes hinges his theory on the breakdown not being the strength of Kolisi's game. "It is with Louw, New Zealand gambled with an extra lineup man and lost the gamble as England controlled collisions and, with it, the tempo of the game. South Africa will be more comfortable than the All Blacks with slow possession — they will kick a great deal — but defensively, the Springboks have to halt the momentum that England bring to the game, especially early on."

Barnes stresses that Louw will be wasted



Francois Louw has proved better than post-knee-injury Kolisi (pic). Reuters

in the last 25 minutes; the damage will be done. "Far more sensible to ask him to match Underhill and Tom Curry in contact and keep South Africa within range to throw everything, Kolisi et al, for an unstoppable Springbok surge in the final 20 minutes."

TWEAK TO INSPIRATION STORY

Barnes was inspired to pen the column after a happy Rassie declared post the Wales scrap that he was unafraid to take brave calls.

"Within the media, the decision not to select his captain would be the headline. Yet, as

Eddie Jones has shown with his treatment of George Ford, selection is about matching forces to strategy. If Erasmus can finish without his skipper and without hyperbole, why can he not start without him and finish with him? After all, if South Africa win, Kolisi will lift the trophy. Ramaphosa would have his Mandela moment. Play it the other way, bow to a perceived political imperative and the chances of any South African getting anywhere near lifting the trophy are diminished. Who would be Erasmus? The right rugby call may very well be the wrong political one; the politically correct one possibly the wrong rugby call. The easy choice is to stick to this; no one would criticise Erasmus. The other choice would be one of the bravest of all time. It may go down in history as a great call; conversely, it may be the end of Erasmus. Jones has made a few big calls in his time but none like this."

SIYASTORY

Siya Kolisi was raised by his grandmother, uncle and aunt in a Port Elizabeth township. At the age of eight he was identified as a rare rugby talent and educated at Grey Junior and then Grey High. His rugby-based education took him to Stellenbosch, the Stormers, a man-of-the-match debut against Scotland in 2013, Stormer captaincy.

The Springbok captaincy came in a circuitous way but you have to be cynical to put it down to quotas. Barnes recalls, "Had Warren Whiteley or Eben Etzebeth been fit the chances are Kolisi would not have been named captain. The flanker led South Africa in 2018 but only when Etzebeth was forced from the field."

David Walsh of *Times*, recalls, "'On a Monday morning in late May last year the South Africa rugby squad had a meeting at their Johannesburg hotel. The team had a three-test series against England as their immediate goal, the 2019 World Cup as their ultimate target and they needed to choose a captain. Siya Kolisi sat amongst his teammates not thinking for a second it might be him. Rassie Erasmus, the head coach, speaks matter-of-factly, his tone rarely changing. Kolisi remembers everything up to the moment Erasmus said that he, Kolisi, would captain the team for the series against England. Everything that came after that sailed right past him without stopping."

Later that morning Erasmus would say he'd known Kolisi since he'd entered the Western Province academy as an 18-year-old and chose him to lead the Springboks because of his leadership and humility."

FESTIVAL SPECIAL TRAINS-2019

In order to clear extra rush of passengers for Chhath Puja Festival, Railways have planned to run the following Festival Special Trains as per schedule given below:-

Spl. Train No.	Station From	Dept. Time	Station to	Arr. Time	Frequency/Day	Period	Accommodation
04001	Bhagalpur	18:45	Anand Vihar (T)	17:40	Fri	On 01.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04408	New Delhi	19:25	Muzaffarpur	16:30	Tue	On 05.11.2019	AC 3 Tier
04407	Muzaffarpur	23:20	New Delhi	22:10	Wed	On 06.11.2019	
04414	New Delhi	19:25	Saharsa	20:00	Fri	On 01.11.2019	AC 3 Tier
04413	Saharsa	22:15	New Delhi	22:10	Sat	On 02.11.2019	
04079	Patna Jn. (Suvidha)	12:00	New Delhi	04:00	Fri	On 01.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier
04078	New Delhi	14:55	Patna Jn.	08:30	Fri	On 01.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04077	Patna Jn.	12:00	New Delhi	04:00	Sat	On 02.11.2019	
04052	Anand Vihar (T)	11:45	Katihar Jn.	12:45	Fri	On 01.11.2019	Sleeper & General
04051	Katihar Jn.	20:00	Anand Vihar (T)	23:00	Sat	On 02.11.2019	
04093	Jogbani (Suvidha)	09:00	Anand Vihar (T)	16:05	Sat	On 02.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
82410	Delhi (Suvidha)	11:00	Darbhanga	08:30	Mon	On 04.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier
04023	Darbhanga (Suvidha)	12:00	Delhi	12:40	Tue	On 05.11.2019	
04401	Anand Vihar (T)	23:00	Shri Mata Vaishno Devi Katra	14:00	Thu	On 04.11.2019	1st AC, AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier
04402	Shri Mata Vaishno Devi Katra	23:30	Anand Vihar (T)	14:20	Tue, Fri	Upto 05.11.2019	
04998	Bathinda	20:50	Varanasi	19:20	Sun	On 03.11.2019	AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04997	Varanasi	21:20	Bathinda	19:15	Mon	On 04.11.2019	
04420	H. Nizamuddin	20:50	Lucknow	06:30	Mon	On 04.11.2019	1st AC, AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier
04419	Lucknow	19:05	H. Nizamuddin	05:30	Thu	On 07.11.2019	
04422	Anand Vihar (T)	21:05	Lucknow	06:30	Wed	On 06.11.2019	1st AC, AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier
04421	Lucknow	19:05	Anand Vihar (T)	05:15	Tue	On 05.11.2019	
04502	Nangaldam	23:45	Lucknow	14:00	Mon	On 04.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04501	Lucknow	21:30	Nangaldam	13:00	Tue	On 05.11.2019	
04612	Shri Mata Vaishno Devi Katra	23:30	Varanasi	03:05	Sun	On 03.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04611	Varanasi	06:00	Shri Mata Vaishno Devi Katra	13:15	Tue	On 05.11.2019	
04409	Delhi Jn.	18:25	Shri Mata Vaishno Devi Katra	09:05	Tue, Fri, Sun	Upto 05.11.2019	AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04410	Shri Mata Vaishno Devi Katra	13:15	Delhi Jn.	03:00	Wed, Sat, Mon	Upto 06.11.2019	
04074	New Delhi	15:30	Varanasi	07:00	Fri	On 01.11.2019	Sleeper & General
04073	Varanasi	09:50	New Delhi	01:45	Sat	On 02.11.2019	
04923	Gorakhpur	22:10	Chandigarh	14:25	Fri	On 01.11.2019	1st AC, AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04046	Anand Vihar (T)	23:35	Gorakhpur	13:35	Sat	On 02.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04045	Gorakhpur	17:25	Anand Vihar (T)	07:15	Sun	On 03.11.2019	
04418	H. Nizamuddin	21:35	Pune	05:25	Tue	On 05.11.2019	1st AC, AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier
04417	Pune	05:15	H. Nizamuddin	01:35	Thu	On 07.11.2019	
04044	Anand Vihar (T)	00:10	Gaya Jn.	20:20	Sun	On 03.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04043	Gaya Jn.	23:20	Anand Vihar (T)	17:05	Sun	On 03.11.2019	
04022	Anand Vihar (T)	00:10	Patna	17:45	Sat	On 02.11.2019	AC 3 Tier
04021	Patna	20:30	Anand Vihar (T)	14:10	Sat	On 02.11.2019	
04030	Delhi Jn.	13:45	Muzaffarpur Jn.	13:00	Sat	On 02.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04029	Muzaffarpur Jn.	14:15	Delhi Jn.	14:00	Sun	On 03.11.2019	
04010	Anand Vihar (T)	23:45	Jogbani	05:20	Tue	On 05.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04009	Jogbani	09:00	Anand Vihar (T)	16:05	Thu	on 07.11.2019	
04038	Delhi Jn.	20:50	Chhapra	15:30	Sat, Tue	Upto 05.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04037	Chhapra	23:30	Delhi Jn.	18:15	Sun, Wed	Upto 06.11.2019	
04098	Anand Vihar (T)	00:30	Gaya Jn.	22:30	Fri	On 01.11.2019	AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04097	Gaya Jn.	17:15	Anand Vihar (T)	13:00	Sun	On 03.11.2019	
04193	Agra Cantt.	10:40	Jammu Tawi	01:25	Fri	Upto 13.12.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04194	Jammu Tawi	05:30	Agra Cantt.	21:00	Sat	Upto 14.12.2019	
82107	Mumbai (CSMT) (Suvidha)	14:10	Lucknow	13:15	Tue	On 05.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
01020	Lucknow (Suvidha)	15:00	Mumbai (CSMT)	17:35	Wed	On 06.11.2019	
81453	Pune (Suvidha)	21:30	Gorakhpur	08:30	Mon	On 04.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
01454	Gorakhpur (Suvidha)	10:45	Pune	21:00	Wed	On 06.11.2019	
04921	Saharanpur	04:45	Ambala Cantt	06:30	Daily	Upto 15.11.2019	General
04922	Ambala Cantt	20:40	Saharanpur	22:40	Daily	Upto 15.11.2019	
05101	Chhapra	16:00	Delhi Jn.	12:40	Sun	Upto 10.11.2019	General
05102	Delhi Jn.	15:05	Chhapra	10:55	Mon	Upto 11.11.2019	
04193	Jhansi	07:15	Jammu Tawi	01:25	Fri	Upto 13.12.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04194	Jammu Tawi	05:30	Jhansi	00:20	Sat	Upto 14.12.2019	
04111	Kanpur Cental	17:40	Jammu Tawi	13:50	Wed	Upto 27.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04112	Jammu Tawi	22:10	Kanpur Cental	18:55	Thu	Upto 28.11.2019	
03427	Malda Town	09:05	Haridwar	14:05	Mon	Upto 25.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
03428	Haridwar	15:40	Malda Town	23:30	Tue	Upto 26.11.2019	

82905	Mumbai Central (Suvidha)	16:00	New Delhi	07:55	Fri, Sun, Tue	On 01.11.2019 & 20.12.2019 to 31.12.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier
09006	New Delhi (Suvidha)	14:50	Mumbai Central	06:55	Sat, Mon, Wed	On 02.11.2019 & 21.12.2019 to 01.01.2020	
04028	New Delhi	10:40	Dwarka	16:10	Mon	On 04.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04027	Dwarka	20:00	New Delhi	01:45	Tue	On 05.11.2019	
09005	Mumbai Central	16:00	New Delhi	07:55	Sun, Tue	03.11.2019 to 17.12.2019	
09006	New Delhi (Special train on special fare)	14:50	Mumbai Central	06:55	Mon, Wed	04.11.2019 to 18.12.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier
09021	Bandra (T)	05:10	Jammu Tawi	15:30	Monday	Upto 30.12.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, AC Chair Car
09022	Jammu Tawi	02:30	Bandra (T)	10:20	Wednesday	Upto 01.01.2020	
82911	Udhana (Suvidha)	23:55	Chhapra	06:15	Sunday	Upto 10.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
82912	Chhapra (Suvidha)	07:50	Udhana	13:15	Tuesday	Upto 12.11.2019	
82941	Ahmedabad (Suvidha)	16:10	Delhi Sarai Rohilla	06:50	Friday	On 01.11.2019	AC 3 Tier
09414	Delhi Sarai Rohilla	15:50	Ahmedabad	07:00	Saturday	On 02.11.2019	
09413	Ahmedabad Humsafar	16:10	Delhi Sarai Rohilla	06:50	Friday	Upto 29.11.2019	AC 3 Tier
09414	Delhi Sarai Rohilla Humsafar	15:50	Ahmedabad	07:00	Saturday	Upto 30.11.2019	
82945	Gandhidham (Suvidha)	17:40	Bhagalpur	20:15	Friday	On 01.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
09452	Bhagalpur (Suvidha)	06:30	Gandhidham	08:00	Monday	On 04.11.2019	
09451	Gandhidham (Suvidha)	17:40	Bhagalpur	20:15	Friday	08.11.2019 to 29.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
09452	Bhagalpur (Suvidha)	06:30	Gandhidham	08:00	Monday	11.11.2019 to 02.12.2019	
04092	New Delhi	09:20	Jaynagar	11:15	Fri	On 01.11.2019	Sleeper & General
04091	Jaynagar	15:30	New Delhi	19:30	Sat	On 02.11.2019	
82101	Lokmanya Tilak (T)	23:05	Varanasi	01:30	Sunday	On 03.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
82102	Varanasi	08:00	Lokmanya Tilak (T)	08:20	Tuesday	On 05.11.2019	
82109	Pune	00:25	Hazrat Nizamuddin	01:00	Tuesday	On 05.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
82110	Hazrat Nizamuddin	04:00	Pune	07:25	Wednesday	On 06.11.2019	
82119	Lokmanya Tilak (T)	05:10	Gorakhpur	12:45	Saturday	Upto 09.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, Sleeper & General
82120	Gorakhpur	15:45	Lokmanya Tilak (T)	05:00	Sunday	Upto 10.11.2019	
04093	Jogbani	09:00	Anand Vihar (T)	16:05	Saturday	On 02.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04920	Ferozpur (via Delhi)	16:45	Darbhanga	04:00	Friday	On 01.11.2019	General
04919	Darbhanga	15:30	Ferozpur (via Delhi)	04:55	Sunday	On 03.11.2019	
04090	Anand Vihar (T)	12:45	Bhagalpur	10:10	Fri	On 01.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
04089	Bhagalpur	11:30	Anand Vihar (T)	13:15	Sat	On 02.11.2019	
04087	Darbhanga	02:30	New Delhi	00:30	Fri	On 01.11.2019	Sleeper
82406	New Delhi	10:55	Saharsa	11:30	Fri	On 01.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier & Sleeper
04031	Saharsa	18:00	New Delhi	19:50	Sat	On 02.11.2019	
04085	Saharsa	22:15	Anand Vihar (T)	22:10	Fri	On 01.11.2019	AC 3 Tier & Sleeper
82365	Patna	20:30	Anand Vihar (T)	14:20	Sun, Thu	On 03, 07 & 10.11.2019	AC 2 Tier, AC 3 Tier & Sleeper
03266	Anand Vihar (T)	18:35	Patna	16:30	Mon, Fri	On 04, 08 & 11.11.2019	
82527	Darbhanga (Suvidha)	21:30	Delhi	22:10	Monday	On 04.11.2019	AC 3 Tier, Sleeper & General
82528	Delhi (Suvidha)	00:10	Darbhanga	23:45	Wednesday	On 06.11.2019	
05531	Saharsa Special	21:35	Delhi	02:00	Tue, Friday	On 05 & 08.11.2019	